

Volume 18 Number 1 January 2007





JOURNAL OF ISLAMIC STUDIES

EDITOR

Dr Farhan Ahmad Nizami Magdalen College, Oxford

CONSULTANT EDITORS

Professor Zafar Ishaq Ansari International Islamic University, Islamabad

Professor Muhammad Adnan Al-Bakhit University of Jordan, Jordan

Professor M. Kamal Hassan International Islamic University, Malaysia

Professor Ekmeleddin İhsanoglu Secretary-General of the Organization of the Islamic Conference

Professor Abdul-Nabi Isstaif University of Damascus, Syria

Professor Yuzo Itagaki University of Tokyo

Professor Wadad Kadi University of Chicago Professor Wilferd F. Madelung St John's College, Oxford

Dr Ali A. Mazrui State University of New York, Binghamton

Professor Seyyed Hossein Nasr George Washington University, Washington

Professor James Piscatori Wadham College, Oxford

DR RICHARD C. REPP St Cross College, Oxford

Professor Francis Robinson Royal Holloway, University of London

> Professor A. I. Sabra Harvard University

MANAGING EDITOR

DR JAMIL QURESHI St Edmund Hall, Oxford

JOURNAL OF ISLAMIC STUDIES

VOLUME 18 NUMBER 1 JANUARY 2007

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

The Financial Reforms of the Caliph al-Muʿtaḍid (279-89/892-90 Ahmad Al-Hasan	1) 1
Ayatollah Khomeini and the Contemporary Debate on Freedom Sussan Siavoshi	14
Beyond Politics: the Reality of a Deobandi Madrasa in Pakistan Masooda Bano	43
A Daughter in the Indonesian Muhammadiyah: Nasyiatul Aisyiyah Negotiates a New Status and Image	
Siti Syamsiyatun	69
BOOK REVIEWS	
 M. M. al-Azami: The History of the Qur'ānic Text from Revelation to Compilation: A Comparative Study. By Mustansir Mir. Harald Motzki (ed.): Hadith: Origins and Developments. 	95
By Recep Şentürk. 3. Hiroyuki Yanagihashi: A History of the Early Islamic Law of Property: Reconstructing the Legal Development, 7th–9th Centuries.	97
By Mohammad H. Fadel. 4. Michael Cook: Studies in the Origins of Early Islamic Culture and	100
Tradition. By Suleiman A. Mourad.	102
Thought in the Near East, c. 600-c. 1100. By Tony Street.	103
6. S. J. Badakhchani (ed.): Paradise of Submission: A Medieval Treatise on Ismaili Thought. A New Persian Edition and English Translation	
of Naṣīr al-Dīn Ṭūsī's Rawḍa-yi taslīm. By Sajjad H. Rizvi. 7. Farhad Daftary: Ismailis in Medieval Muslim Societies.	105
By Wilferd Madelung.	108
By Rahim Acar.	109
9. John Brooke and Ekmeleddin İhsanoğlu (eds.): Religious Values & the Rise of Science in Europe. By Anna Akasoy.	112
.,	112

Bernd Radtke: Neue kritische Gänge: Zu Stand und Aufgaben der Sufikforschung/New Critical Essays: on the Present State and Future 115 Tasks of the Study of Sufism. By Thomas Dahnhardt. 11. Patrice Cressier, Maribel Fierro and Luis Molina (eds.): Los Almohades: 118 Problemas v Perspectivas. By L. P. Harvey. 12. Scott S. Reese (ed.): The Transmission of Learning in Islamic Africa. 124 By Murray Last. Suraiva Faroghi and Randi Deguilhem (eds.): Crafts and Craftsmen of the Middle East. Fashioning the Individual in the Muslim Mediterranean. 125 By Annika Rabo. 14. Jens Hanssen: Fin de Siècle Beirut. The Making of An Ottoman 128 Provincial Capital. By Ebru Boyar. 15. Maurits H. van den Boogert: The Capitulations and the Ottoman Legal System: Qadis, Consuls and Beratlis in the 18th Century. 131 By Richard C. Repp. 16. Yıldız Atasoy: Turkey, Islamists and Democracy: Transition and Globalization in a Muslim State. By M. Sükrü Hanioğlü. 134 17. Seyed Mohammad Ali Taghavi: The Flourishing of Islamic Reformism in Iran. Political Islamic Groups in Iran (1941-1961). By Vanessa Martin. 136 18. Youssef M. Choueiri (ed.): A Companion to the History of the 138 Middle East. By Anoush Ehteshaami. 19. Hafizullah Emadi: Culture and Customs of Afghanistan; Angelo Rasnavagam: Afghanistan: a Modern History. By Thomas 139 Barfield. 20. Rowena Robinson: Tremors of Violence: Muslim Survivors of Ethnic 142 Strife in Western India. By Asghar Ali Engineer. 21. Jytte Klausen: The Islamic Challenge: Politics and Religion in Western 144 Europe. By Humayun Ansari. 22. Nabil Matar: Britain and Barbary, 1589-1689. By Ahmad Gunny. 147 23. Abdulkader Thomas (ed.): Interest in Islamic Economics: Understanding 149 Ribā. By Mohamed Aslam Haneef. 24. Sami Tamer: The Islamic Financial System; Salahuddin Ahmed: Islamic Banking, Finance and Insurance: a Global 152 Overview. By Rodney Wilson. 157 BOOKS RECEIVED

THE FINANCIAL REFORMS OF THE CALIPH AL-MU'TADID (279–89/892–901)

AHMAD AL-HASAN University of Kuwait

INTRODUCTION

This study examines a historical phenomenon during the caliphate of al-Mu'tadid bi-llāh Aḥmad b. Ṭalḥa (r. 279–89/892–901), namely the remarkable finance-generating policies of his administration. When al-Mu'tadid succeeded to the caliphate, the State Treasury (bayt al-māl)¹ was virtually empty apart from some few dirhams,² on account of the circumstances faced by and the actions of his predecessor, caliph al-Mu'tamid 'alā-llāh Aḥmad b. al-Mutawakkil (r. 259–79/869–92). First, there had been the internal revolts, especially the Zanj rebellion, which lasted some fifteen years, from 255/868 to 270/883.³ Second, some of the major Islamic territories had seceded, notably Egypt and al-Shām, controlled by the Tulunids (254–92/868–96),⁴ and Persia,

¹ For details about *bayt al-māl*, see ʿAlī b. Muḥammad al-Māwardī, *al-Aḥkām al-sulṭāniyyah wa-l-walāyat al-dīniyyah* (Cairo: Dār al-Fikr, 1973), 213–15; Cl. Cahen, 'Bayt al-māl', *EI*² art. (i. 1131–7); Khawlah al-Dujayfī, *Bayt al-māl* (Baghdad: Wizārat al-Awqāf, 1976).

² Hilāl b. al-Muḥassin, al-Ṣābī, Tuḥfat al-umarā' fī ta'rīkh al-wuzarā' (Cairo: Dār Iḥyā' al-Kutub al-ʿArabiyyah, 1958), 13; M. A. Shaban, Islamic History: A New Interpretation, 750–1055/132–448 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 119.

³ Muḥammad b. Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, *Ta'rīkh al-rusul wa-l-muluk* (Beirut: Dār Suwaydan, n.d.), ix. 410 f., 477 f., 504 f., 520 f., 577, 633; Abū l-Ḥasan ʿAlī b. al-Ḥasan al-Masʿūdī, *Murūj al-dhahab* (Beirut: Dār al-Maʿrifa, 1982), iv. 194 f., 207 f.

⁴ Al-Mas'ūdī, *Murūj*, iv. 382 f. For details about the Tulunids, see H. A. R. Gibb, 'Tulūnids', *EI*¹ art. (viii. 834–6); Ḥasan Ibrāhīm Ḥasan, *Ta'rīkh al-Islām*, (Beirut: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth, 1964), iii. 126 f.

[©] The Author (2006). Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of the Oxford Centre for Islamic Studies. All rights reserved. For Permissions, please email: journals.permissions@oxfordjournals.org

BOOK REVIEWS

traditions, religious ideas and the new ideas coming from the West. This is a very valuable contribution to the history of intellectual contacts between the Ottomans and the early modern West and offers intriguing glimpses of Muslim perceptions of the political and technological rise of Western Europe. It covers an almost entirely neglected area in the history of Islamic science and should also be of great interest to those primarily concerned with astronomy in the West.

Sonja Brentjes, in a brilliant article that deserves to be read by every historian of Islamic science, describes how Western authors have shaped the image of the barbarian Turk and the cultivated Persian and laid the foundation for persisting trends in the historiography of science. She presents a complex analysis of three case studies, contrasts the statements of Western authors with her own findings regarding Ottoman science, and points to a number of reasons for the rise of those images, which are clearly a distortion of the reality of science in the early modern Islamic world.

By and large, this is a fascinating collection of articles, some of which are truly excellent and very readable. They explore new areas and material and appeal to a larger audience, whereas others will be read only by those interested in the specific subject. In particular, the two articles on Galileo might have been better published in a journal or a volume dedicated to this author. Historians of science should applaud the fact that this volume combines articles on both Christian and Islamic religion and science. This has become common in medieval studies, but publications on later centuries too often focus on one cultural milieu. Regrettably, the third religion on the European continent, Judaism, has been almost completely left out. Furthermore, the articles in this volume are largely self-contained and do not connect with each other's ideas. Some of the articles in the section on Lutheranism compare Luther's impact with that of Melanchthon, and Lutheranism with Calvinism and other religious trends of that time, yet the opportunity for a profound comparative perspective, in particular between Christianity and Islam, is missed. Only the two articles on Islamic history of science combine aspects of East and West in an interesting way.

The variety of topics, historical and cultural contexts, and analytical perspectives, would have required an ambitious and original framework to hold these pieces together in a single, coherent book. Unfortunately, the framework as expressed in the title remains weak and inconsistent. The authors offer interesting insights into relations between religion and science, yet the question of human values and religious values in particular, is almost nowhere addressed in any depth. Most authors dismiss the notion of an immediate impact of religion—in the sense of a set of doctrines—on scientific developments (as proposed by Weber) as too general, or they do not raise such questions in the first place.

John North's article might have served the purpose of defining the general scope of the book. Yet, unlike most other articles, it offers only rather kaleidoscopic glimpses into various examples of transmission of science. Over the past twenty years a number of great scholars (e.g. Thomas Glick with his comparative study on Islamic and Christian Spain) have dealt with intellectual exchanges between the

different religious groups in the Middle Ages and in early modern times, but their research has been completely ignored in this article.

Finally, there are several technical shortcomings that should probably be blamed on the publisher. The production of the text is rather unsatisfactory—the articles are not carefully edited and contain a number of typos and syntactic lapses. Also, readers interested in more than one article would have been helped by an index.

Anna Akasoy Warburg Institute E-mail: Anna.Akasoy@sas.ac.uk doi:10.1093/jis/etl054

Neue kritische Gänge: Zu Stand und Aufgaben der Sufikforschung/New Critical Essays: on the Present State and Future Tasks of the Study of Sufism

BY BERND RADTKE (Utrecht: M. Th. Houtsma Stichting, 2005), 330 pp. Price PB Not given. ISBN 90-801040-6-X.

This compact book contains a collection of five essays mostly written in German by the Utrecht-based Islamicist Bernd Radtke at different moments during the past twenty years. Originally meant for separate publication, the essays address a wide range of different subjects linked, as the title suggests, by the common purpose of critically assessing the quality of recent scholarship in the field of Islamic Studies in general and the study of Sufism in particular. In a selfconsciously provocative manner, Radtke bluntly denounces what he sees as the deplorable state of contemporary scholarship, especially among the younger generation of Islamicists. In many regards a representative of the old German school, Radtke mainly criticizes the lack of precision in translating mediaeval Arabic and Persian Sufi texts and the adoption of false premises which, as he sees it (essays 2 and 3), result in the inevitable failure to analyse and interpret the texts correctly. This criticism extends to more general theoretical issues and, among other things, questions the validity of an intellectual approach— especially in history and social anthropology and notably in Anglo-Saxon academia-based on the application of modern Western theories to ideas and concepts perceived as very remote both in time and in space.

In the first essay titled 'Von der unerträglichen Nettigkeit des Seins' (About the unbearable kindness of Being, pp. 1–25), Radtke voices his critical concern with regard to the work of the renowned German scholar Annemarie Schimmel. Written on the occasion of the award to Schimmel in 1995 of the highly acclaimed German Friedenspreis des Deutschen Buchhandels—one of the country's highest recognitions for outstanding intellectual contributions in the field of humanities—for the promotion of a better understanding between the Western world and Islam, it sparked a heated controversy in Germany because of Schimmel's apparently supportive stance (expressed shortly before the

BOOK REVIEWS

117

official award ceremony headed by the German president) on the fatwa issued by Iran's Ayatollah Khomeini against the Indo-British author Salman Rushdie.

After duly defending Schimmel against the outrageously superficial criticism voiced by the so-called liberal-progressive elite (including influential writers like Günter Grass), who accused her of sympathizing with Islamic fundamentalists and oppressive regimes in the Middle-East, Radtke takes the opportunity to raise the impertinent question of what indeed were the positions held by Schimmel with regard to Islam, and how did she convey her understanding of Islam to the wider public? Radtke expresses unease with the apparently exaggerated desire for 'harmony' (Harmonisierungsbedürfniss, p. 5) that underlies Schimmel's opinions and denounces the underlying sentimentality. That approach, however appealing to Muslims frustrated by the predominantly hostile and biased perceptions of Islam in the West, often proves detrimental to sound, objective scholarship and in-depth knowledge of technical issues.

Admittedly, forbearance (not only of the specialist scholar) is often taxed by the 'we are all brothers and love each other' invocations that permeate so many of Schimmel's works. The attraction of such invocations for certain 'openminded, tolerant and half-cultured' Westerners embarrassed by the belligerent barking of their political leaders and the demented propaganda common in the mass-media, and for certain alienated Muslims under pressure to stress the accommodative 'compatible' elements in Islam, certainly does undermine the position of honour to which Schimmel has been elevated. Yet, one should not lose sight of Schimmel's extraordinary intuitive capacity to participate in the subtle nature of Muslim thought and imagination that characterizes, for instance, the manifold poetic compositions so typical not only of the Islamic world (for which she has been rightly appreciated in many Eastern countries) but of traditional humanity in general.

The second and by far the longest article of the book (pp. 27-201) consists of an exhaustive comparative translation-cum-analysis of a well-known treatise by the famous mediaeval Sufi shaykh Ibn al-'Arabī, titled Risālat al-anwār fī mā yumnah sāhib al-khalwa min al-asrār. Based on analysis of ten different versions of this Arabic text (including ancient manuscripts and more recent printed editions), Radtke's philological study, in the best tradition of German Orientalism, first reproduces the text in transliteration, than carefully proposes his own translation, immediately followed by its English translation by John O'Kane. These are then painstakingly compared against the English translation, passage by passage, of the same text by Rabia Terry Harris in her Journey to the Lord of Power (1981), its German rendering by Franz Langmayr, Michel Chodkiewicz's French translation titled La double échelle, and, finally, Miguel Asín Palacio's dated Spanish version of the same text published in 1931. It points to the particular philological and analytical shortcomings in Harris' rendering, shortcomings worsened by the translator's failure to go back to the relevant original sources. While this detailed critique is in most cases to the point, especially from a strictly linguistic point of view, after reading a few dozen pages of it I cannot help wondering what the purpose of the exercise really is. One is bound to share a certain perplexity, even dismay, at some of the lax stylistic rendering and choice of terminology, but also to ask what the overall goal of academic scholarship is. Do we really get any closer to a more faithful understanding of Ibn al-'Arabī's complex doctrines if we complain about rendering the term *al-Ḥaqq* as 'Truth' rather than reflecting the notion of this being a Divine name by translating it as 'God' (pp. 53, 56)?

The third essay, 'Utrechter Elegie', is again mainly philological, but here the original texts examined are chiefly taken from the Persian tradition dealing with aspects of Central Asian Sufism. Again, Radtke examines in great detail the quality of the translations and commentary in English, German and Russian provided by five younger contemporary scholars in their contributions to the third volume of the series Muslim Culture in Russia and Central Asia (2000), containing studies on Arabic, Persian and Turkic manuscripts from the fifteenth to nineteenth centuries. Following the pattern of the previous essay, Radtke proceeds to compare (partially) the work produced by those scholars with his own suggestions. He concludes that none of them possesses the linguistic and philological skills required to edit such texts, even condemning one of the contributions (an interesting treatise by the fourteenth-fifteenth century Naqshbandi shaykh Muḥammad Pārsā on the importance of the dhikr) as 'deserving to be thrown in the wastebasket' (die vorliegende [übersetzung] hätte in den papierkorb gehört, p. 205) and calling its author a 'philological robber' (philologischer räuber).

The fourth essay (pp. 251-92), 'Von den hinderlichen Wirkungen der Extase und dem Wesen der Ignoranz' (The effects of ecstasy and the nature of ignorance), is the most personal of the essays and tries to explain the author's doubts about the validity of applying Max Weber's theories to the understanding of mediaeval Sufism. On the basis of analysis of two articles by Christopher Melchert ('The transition from asceticism to mysticism at the middle of the ninth century CE,' in Der Islam, 1996) and the famous Islam Observed by Geertz, Radtke points out some of the 'essential misjudgements' peculiar to 'social anthropologists [the former] and historians [the latter] alike'. In the light of what he defines as 'unclean methodological [i.e. philological] analysis of the material examined' and the indiscriminate application of 'pre-defined theories' (p. 253), Radtke then denies to the perpetrators of such misjudgements—among them he includes also scholars like Ernest Gellner and Dale Eickelmann-the right to criticize the naïveté of attitude alleged of the Orientalists. In the conclusion of this article, Radtke pays tribute to his friend and teacher Fritz Meier, the renowned Islamicist based in Basle, and defines himself as a realist in the sense intended by the anthroposophist Rudolf Steiner, whose teachings, it turns out, constitute one of Radtke's major sources of inspiration.

The fifth and last essay (pp. 292–302), the only one written entirely in English, revisits the position held in an article ('Neo-Sufism Reconsidered', *Der Islam*, 70 (1993), pp. 52–87) written by Radtke with Sean O'Fahey. In it the two authors analyse and ultimately reject the label of neo-Sufism (i.e. from the eighteenth century onwards) attached by some scholars to some recent phenomena in Sufism. This short article contains an exhaustive and useful list of recent publications addressing the topic (including those of Radtke himself) and leads

BOOK REVIEWS

him to conclude the validity of 'Neo-Sufism Reconsidered' and reaffirm its basic points, here re-presented in nine major points. The points are: rejection of popular practices, rejection of the doctrine of wahdat al-wujūd, emphasis on moral and social training, union with the spirit of the Prophet, legitimation of the order's founder, creation of mass organizations, renewed emphasis on hadith studies, rejection of taqlūd, the will to take political and military measures in defence of Islam.

To conclude, this is no doubt a solid piece of precise philological work, rare these days, in which the author impressively juxtaposes his own thorough analytic procedure against the method and approach of other contemporary scholars. Though his criticism is well-grounded and often appropriate, there cannot and should not be any hegemony of one method and approach over others. One should remain open to different approaches and look for the fruitful contributions of each to a complex picture of an even more complex reality. Finally, I am bound to note, by the by, typos which, though not very serious and consequential in themselves and most probably not attributable to the author himself, must be something of an embarrassment in view of the pedantic precision advocated by the author and made the central theme of an entire book.

Thomas Dahnhardt Oxford Centre for Islamic Studies E-mail: thomasda@unive.it doi:10.1093/jis/etl055

Los Almohades: Problemas y Perspectivas

EDITED BY PATRICE CRESSIER, MARIBEL FIERRO AND LUIS MOLINA. (Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 2005), 2 vols. li, 1230 pp. Price €69.00. ISBN 84-0008395-4.

Of the nine-centuries long history of Muslim presence in the Iberian peninsula (711-1614), it is not surprising that certain periods attract more attention than others. We want to know about the initial conquest of 711, the great days of the emirate/caliphate of Cordova, and how the story ended—the circumstances under which the political independence of al-Andalus came to be lost in 1492. The intervening four and a half centuries may be less familiar, and yet the period of the Almohads (approximately mid-twelfth to mid-thirteenth century), the subject of these volumes, is certainly not lacking in intrinsic interest, and of importance in the history of Islam and in that of Western Europe. Al-Andalus during this period was firmly integrated into a North African state ruled by Berbers. Compared with the earlier periods, for which our sources are frankly poor, sources on the Almohads are quite good. Yet it was only in the second half of the twentieth century (with the work of Huici Miranda and others), that serious progress was made in disentangling the complexities of this most idiosyncratic polity. The need to understand the interlocking of North African with Iberian phenomena presents special challenges. Between 2000 and 2002 a seminar at the Casa de Velázquez in Madrid under the title of 'The Almohads: problems and perspectives' brought together many of the leading experts in this field. The Casa de Velázquez is the residence in the University of Madrid for scholars from French universities, and the work is a monument to Franco-Spanish intellectual collaboration: 18 papers in Spanish, 17 in French, plus two in English from the US, and one in Arabic by a colleague from Morocco, following a succinct 'Presentation' by the editors (38 pp. in Spanish), which draws the various themes together. (Passages quoted from the non-English papers have been translated by the reviewer.)

There are roughly equal numbers of papers in the fields of (a) archaeology, epigraphy, architecture etc., (b) political and military history, and (c) philosophy and theology. Were the editors wise to include so many detailed studies on architectural or archaeological technicalities? That their decision was justified is well illustrated by Rafael Azuar's paper on a particular feature of Almohad military architecture—'False bonding (el falso despiece) in masonry and crossarched vaulting' (pp. 123–48). That sounds, and is, narrowly technical in the extreme. However, by learning that the 'masonry' in question is (mostly) not stone at all but adobe with lines superimposed on it to give the look of carefully jointed stonework, the reader grasps very directly the sheer urgency of Abū Yūsuf Ya'qūb al-Manṣūr's enormous programme of frontier castles and fortifications. (That the walls were structurally sound all the same is evident from photographs showing them, after more than eight centuries of relative neglect, still standing!)

Among other papers in this section, all of high quality, I will mention only 'Textiles of the Almohad period' by Cristina Partearroyo. One would have thought material so relatively fragile would not have survived in a state to permit detailed analysis. However, Partearroyo's professional persistence enables her to present a very complete survey. The sensational defeat of the Almohads at las Navas de Tolosa (al-'Iqāb) in 609/1212 meant that the captured banners were carefully preserved as trophies in the chapel of the royal monastery of Las Huelgas (Burgos). Other interesting specimens come from the collection of the Instituto de Valencia de Don Juan, and churches over the north of Spain supply specimens of Almohad luxury silks acquired by wealthy prelates, some of the finest craftsmanship available at the time. Perhaps most striking are the decorative elements from the ornate ceremonial vestments of the renowned archbishop Rodrigo Ximénez de Rada (author, *inter alia*, of a *Historia Arabum*).

The question of their Berber heritage and its impact must figure somewhere in studies of the Almohads. Constant Hamés contributes 'The Almohad dynastic power: between Berber, Arab and Islamic family structures' (pp. 425–50). Manuela Marín in 'The Almohad Caliph, an active and a beneficent presence' (pp. 451–76) shows how 'interventionist' (to use a modern term) these Almohad rulers were—surprisingly ready to take up cudgels on behalf of their subjects in detailed cases of maladministration etc.

Hisham al-'Allaoui's 'The Almohad Chancery' (pp. 477–503, with Pascal Burési) shows that the decisions sent through the chancery to commanders in the field were very much those of the caliph at the centre—he alone, for example, could commit troops to battle. In a state spread over vast distances with limited

In this issue

Ahmad Al-Hasan The Financial Reforms of the Caliph al-Muʿtaḍid (279–89/892–901)

Sussan Siavoshi
Ayatollah Khomeini and the Contemporary Debate
on Freedom

Masooda Bano Beyond Politics: the Reality of a Deobandi Madrasa in Pakistan

Siti Syamsiyatun A Daughter in the Indonesian Muhammadiyah: Nasyiatul Aisyiyah Negotiates a New Status and Image

ISSN 0955-2340

www.jis.oxfordjournals.org