

V Ciclo di Studi Medievali

Atti del Convegno

3-4 giugno 2019

Firenze



N U M E

GRUPPO DI RICERCA
SUL MEDIOEVO LATINO



Prima edizione 2019

Edizioni EBS Print

ISBN 978-88-9349-584-4

Copyright © 2019 NUME Gruppo di Ricerca sul Medioevo Latino

Finito di stampare nel mese di Maggio 2019
presso Etabeta-ps in Lesmo (MB)

È vietata la produzione, totale o parziale, con qualsiasi mezzo e per qualsiasi utilizzo, anche ad uso didattico, se non autorizzata in forma scritta dal Curatore

Indice

3 Giugno

Sala Blu

Sessione di Archeologia | Paesaggi 1

- Panel *La Sardegna nel Medioevo: nuove ricerche ed esperienze.
Fonti scritte, testimonianze materiali, progetti di valorizzazione e comunicazione*
- 15 Fabio Pinna
*Paesaggi e passaggi 'periferici' della storia medievale in Sardegna:
il ruolo dell'archeologia, tra ricerca, condivisione e proposte di sviluppo*
- 21 Francesco Mameli
*Archeologia dei confini nella Sardegna medievale: le curatorie del Giudicato di Gallura
nella Sardegna del XIII e XIV secolo*
- 29 Mattia Sanna Montanelli
*De his qui ad ecclesias confugiunt. Appunti per la ricostruzione del paesaggio minerario
di Villa di Chiesa (Iglesias, SU) in età pre-pisana, tra potere civile ed ecclesiastico*
- 35 Andrea Pergola
*Una fonte per lo studio della Sardegna al tempo di Alfonso il Magnanimo:
Las Cartas Reales dell'Archivio della Corona d'Aragona*
- 41 Valentina Milia
*Nuove ipotesi cronologiche sulla frequentazione del Palazzo di Baldu (Luogosanto, Sardegna):
riflessioni sull'abbandono del villaggio medievale sulla base dei ritrovamenti di maiolica di
Montelupo Fiorentino*
- 48 Nicoletta Usai
*Pittura su tavola nella Corona d'Aragona tra XIV e XV secolo.
Rapporti e relazioni tra Sardegna, penisola italiana e territori iberici*
- 55 Federico Tedeschi
Analisi, valorizzazione e fruizione del patrimonio architettonico religioso della Sardegna nel Trecento
- 62 Sara Valdes
*Il Medioevo 2.0 in Sardegna. Limiti e nuovi scenari di ricerca interdisciplinari
per un'archeologia che comunica e connette*
- 69 Daniele Fadda
Rievocatori e divulgazione storica. Potenzialità e limiti della living history in Sardegna

- 76 Valerio Luca Floris
*Ricerca dell'efficienza amministrativa. L'evoluzione della magistratura patrimoniale
in capite del Regno di Sardegna e Corsica nel periodo 1323-1421*

Sessione di Archeologia | Paesaggi 2

- 82 Sandrino Marra
*Lo sviluppo e la vita del borgo fortificato di Jobia in Terra di Lavoro (CE)
attraverso le fonti, lo studio dei materiali ceramici e delle strutture architettoniche*
- 86 Irma Kaplūnaite
Combining historical and archaeological data. Catholics amongst Pagans in Medieval Vilnius
- 92 Rytis Jonaitis
From a flooded valley to a separate suburb. Orthodox in Vilnius in the 13th-15th centuries
- 98 Giacomo Ponticelli
*La 'lunga durata' del controllo militare della Val di Caprio in Lunigiana
attraverso le analisi di visibilità (secoli VI-XIII)*
- 105 Alessandra Rofi
L'insediamento ecclesiastico della Valle di Buti, tra XI e XIV secolo
- 111 Andrea Biondi
L'Arcispedale di S. Maria Nuova in Casentino alla fine del Medioevo: territorio, strutture e viabilità
- 117 Lester Lonardo
*Ingens terraemotus factus est. Primi dati sugli accorgimenti antisismici
nelle strutture fortificate dell'Appennino campano*
- 126 Consuelo Capolupo
*Riutilizzo e trasformazione delle cavità naturali ed artificiali della Campania settentrionale.
Casi studio dal progetto CARE_Campania*
- 134 Lorenzo Fragai
Il Romanico pistoiese: una lettura archeologica, una proposta di ricerca

Sala Giglio

Sessione di Storia

- 143 Gerard Marí i Brull
*Bartolomeo de Bonitis di Orvieto: Magister Generalis Sancti Jacobi di Altopassu
ovvero auditor generalis curie causarum Camere Apostolice*
- 149 Mario Loffredo
Locus horroris et vastae solitudinis... Il desertum cisterdense tra testo e realtà

- 154 Mario Gaglione
Ancora sulla lettera di Sancia d'Aragona Maiorca ai francescani riuniti ad Assisi nel 1334
- Panel *Preaching about Mary Magdalene. Persistency of her sanctity in the early and later Middle Ages*
- 160 Christoph Galle
Preaching about Mary Magdalene in the Carolingian Empire (8th-9th centuries)
- 166 Antonio Marson Franchini
Nicolas de Biard's model sermon on Mary Magdalen
- 174 Matteo Saracini
L'incesto nell'Alto Medioevo: repressione e narrazioni esemplari
- 180 Rita Mei
Il dibattito storiografico intorno a Gregorio VII e la Riforma Gregoriana
- 185 Giulia Calabrò
«Io son advisato como Habondio, cancellero de Bartholomio Collione, ritornò de Burgogna...»: la ricerca dell'ultima impresa del signore di Malpaga, Bartolomeo Colleoni
- 191 Lorenzo Freschi
Forme di potere e conflittualità locali. Società e giustizia nel Friuli del Rinascimento veneziano (XV secolo)
- 196 Antonio Tagliente
L'arcidiocesi di Salerno (989-1047): alcune riflessioni
- 201 Massimo Siani
Governa una città: individui, famiglie e uffici nella pratica amministrativa del Regno di Napoli (XV secolo). Una prima ricostruzione
- 206 Pietro Sorace
Raimondo Berengario V, Il suocero della cristianità
- 212 Eunat Mirones Lozano
Significance and Symbolism of Jewish Clothing Regulations in Medieval Iberia

Sala Capitolò

Sessione di Storia dell'Arte

- 221 Elena R. Trunfio
Architettura religiosa di età normanna nelle province di Reggio Calabria e Messina. Le chiese di rito greco
- 227 Andrea D'Apruzzo
Pellegrinaggio iacobeo e committenza francescana: il caso di Pistoia

- 234 Antonella Ventura
Non troppo lontano da Limoges: cofanetti reliquiari a confronto tra Milano, Firenze, Pisa e Altamura
- 240 Michele Lacerenza
Sotto il manto di san Domenico. Alcune note su una variante iconografica della Madonna della Misericordia nata in seno all'Ordine dei Predicatori
- 248 Sara Ragni
Sepolcri fiorentini del tardo Medioevo e loro riallestimenti barocchi
- 255 Silvia Cacioni
L'edilizia per il culto nella prima metà del Novecento: reminiscenze medievali e sintesi modernista nell'opera di Tullio Rossi
- 263 Elena Catalano
Viaggio nel significato della decorazione scultorea dei pulpiti medievali toscani
- 269 Italia Caradonna
Affreschi primo-quattrocenteschi nell'Arcidiocesi di Capua: riflessioni e qualche novità per l'«alternativa» della provincia

Sessione di Storia della Miniatura e Codicologia

- 275 Luca Salvatelli
Nuove acquisizioni sul De balneis Viterbiensibus. Per un'analisi comparativa delle fonti manoscritte
- 281 Catarina Martins Tibúrcio
Material aspects of fifteenth-century Portuguese illuminated court manuscripts: a common origin?
- 287 Andrea-Bianka Znorovszky
Mary as an Altar and Sacrifice: the Presentation to the Temple in Fourteenth-to-Sixteenth-Century French Miniatures
- 296 Gianluca De Simone
La didattica nel Codex Buranus: nuove ipotesi di studio
- 301 Alfredo García Femenia
Lo scontro tra l'analfabetismo e la scrittura

4 Giugno

Sala Blu

Sessione di Archeologia | Edifici

- 309 Eleonora Casarotti, Chiara Ribolla
Archeologia e analisi degli elevati: metodologie congiunte per lo studio e il restauro della chiesa di San Maurizio di Gravellona Toce
- 315 Federica D'Angelo
La chiesa di San Pietro ad oratorium: dal documento al monumento attraverso le pagine del Chronicon Volturnense
- 321 Alessia Frisetti, Marianna Cuomo, Nicodemo Abate
Archeologia ed analisi dei contesti fortificati in Campania: il caso del Castello di Roccaromana (CE)
- 328 Arancia Boffa
Trasformazioni di un'area pubblica tra il tardoantico e l'altomedioevo: il caso di Sant'Anastasio in Asti
- 335 Giuseppe Mollo, Antonia Solpietro
Il campanile della cattedrale di Nola: sequenze edilizie e fasi cronologiche
- 345 Marco Ciliberti
Gli ipogei funerari della collina della Maddalena a Venosa (PZ)

Sessione di Archeologia | Materiali

- 352 Paola Novara
La lastra dedicatoria dei Ss. Fabiano e Sebastiano e l'epigrafi ravennate dell'XI secolo
- 359 Gemma Alfonso
La ceramica foggiana a matrice nella Toscana di XIV-XV secolo: il contesto stratigrafico della Badia di S. Salvatore a Vaiano (PO)
- 366 Luca Brancazi
Il contributo dei resti faunistici alla conoscenza del consumo di pesce nella Roma di XI secolo: il campione dai focolari del Templum Pacis
- 374 Beatrice Brancazi
Rappresentazioni antropomorfe dalla Maiolica Arcaica alto laziale
- Panel *Ultime acquisizioni del Progetto Ostia Marina*
- 381 Massimiliano David, Maria Stella Graziano, Irene Catanzaro
Cultura del marmo in Ostia teodosiana

- 390 Maria Stella Graziano, Camilla Rosati, Massimiliano David
Flussi commerciali di epoca teodosiana a Ostia
- 397 Massimiliano David, Stefano De Togni
L'opera listata tardoantica a Ostia
- 402 Massimiliano David, Stefano De Togni
Luoghi della produzione nel tardoantico ostiense: nuovi dati dagli scavi dell'insula IV, ix
- 407 Alessandro Melega, Massimiliano David, Stefano De Togni
Morale cristiana e termalismo a Ostia negli ultimi decenni del IV secolo
- 414 Massimiliano David, Enrico Pomo, Alessandro Melega
Scritture esposte datate in contesto a Ravenna
- 421 Eleonora Rossetti, Massimiliano David, Elisa Frigato
Forme di religiosità di ambito rurale nell'Italia settentrionale tardoantica

Sala Giglio

Sessione di Storia

- Panel *L'autorità oltre la legge. La memoria sociale come fonte di potere in Spagna e Italia tra Medioevo e Rinascimento*
- 429 Stefano Bernardinello
*Alla ricerca della nobiltà perduta.
L'importanza della "tradizione" nei milites cittadini italiani tra l'XI e il XII secolo*
- 435 Federica Fiorini
Strategie di legittimazione nella Castiglia del XV secolo: l'ideale neogotico
- 440 Michela Giuntoli
Guidati dalla «felice fortuna». Il viaggio di Filippo de' Medici in Francia nel 1461
- 447 João Rafael Nisa
Rogue: changing sides in late 14th century Portugal
- 452 Filippo Ribani
Tra satira e realtà: i furti agricoli nella Bologna trecentesca
- 457 Nicola Martellozzo
Venerare il patrono, umiliare il nemico
- 464 Giacomo Brotto
La pena di morte come rito sacro

- 470 Giulia Lovison
Ius velut splendor firmamenti: l'opposizione dei giuristi alle teorie demonologiche sulle streghe
- 475 Francesco Mastromatteo
Il Chronicon di Domenico da Gravina: una fonte sulla storia del Mezzogiorno angioino
- 480 Veronica De Duonni
La chiesa di S. Maria di Montevergine e le prime fondazioni di S. Guglielmo
- 488 Sarah Procopio
*La nascita del Made in Italy.
L'apporto della seta grezza calabrese alla rivoluzione tessile italiana tra XIV e XV secolo*
- 494 Anna Pomierny-Wąsińska
Mensurationes in the descriptions of city walls and urban forms (late medieval Florence and Milan)
- 501 Alessandro Furiesi
Le contrade di Volterra
- 507 Abel Lorenzo Rodríguez
*Rites and Riots. Re-enchanting and Legitimizing Violence
as a Medieval Revival in Spain and France (1936-1945)*

Questioni aperte

- 514 Annalisa Colecchia
Eremiti e monasteri nel Parco della Majella: percorsi di ricerca, valorizzazione e marketing sostenibile
- 522 Marco Vito
Le digital humanities negli studi medievistici: metodi, indagini e riflessioni sulla public history
- 527 Alessandro Conti
La letteratura latina medievale nella scuola secondaria di secondo grado

Sala Capitolo

Sessione di Letteratura

- 535 Ilaria Ottria
Tra politica e religione: Dante, la simbologia del libro e la decadenza della Chiesa
- 541 Elisabeth Trischler
Alternative Readings on Dante's Procession in Earthly Paradise
- 546 Davide Esposito
Il concetto di "vendetta" nella Chanson de Jérusalem

- 552 Roberta Marangi
The Spectacle of a Beheading: Movement and Structure
in De Decollatione Sancti Iohannis Baptiste
- 557 Valeria Di Clemente
La tradizione della Capsula eburnea in inglese medio: il caso della doppia versione
del manoscritto Londra, British Library, Add. 34111
- 563 Azzurra Rinaldi
Melusine portoghese: la Dama dal piede di capra e Dona Marinha.
Personaggi fatati del Libro dei Lignaggi del Conte Dom Pedro

Sessione di Filosofia

- 567 Alessio Tanchella
Vita e morte spirituale in Donna me prega e Quaestio de felicitate
- 572 Carlo Maria Poggi
L'escatologia di Bernardo di Clairvaux
- 577 Aurelia Maruggi
La teoria della felicità politica e contemplativa nei commenti
al primo libro dell'Etica Nicomachea di Eustrazio di Nicea e Alberto Magno
- 584 Caitlin Smith Gilson
St. Anselm, St. Thomas and Dante: Christianity and the Medieval Transcendentals
- 594 Ignazio Genovese
La quaestio del fine prossimo primario dell'Incarnazione:
Tommaso d'Aquino e Giovanni Duns Scoto a confronto

Mary as an Altar and Sacrifice: the *Presentation to the Temple* in Fourteenth-to-Sixteenth-Century French Miniatures¹

Andrea-Bianka Znorovszky

The present speech brings into discussion depictions of Mary's youth that concentrate on her presentation to the temple as reflected in French manuscript illuminations pertaining to the fourteenth-to-sixteenth century. It focuses on the differences when visually representing this episode in relation to the textual sources of the very manuscript. Mary's entrance to the temple is traceable to two general patterns: Mary entering the temple (in the company of her parents or alone) and Mary standing on an altar. These representations are sometimes paired with depictions that illustrate the offering of a golden table in the temple of the sun—a detail found in Valerius Maximus and taken over in the Middle Ages. Besides this, Mary's presentation to the Temple is visually connected to the sacrifice of Isaac on an altar. It is the case of the *Speculum humanae salvationis*, for instance, where one can note that Mary becomes a sacrifice/an offering of the parents as emphasized by the text accompanying the miniatures. The paper analyzes these presentations in the framework of cultural developments (reflected in the increase of Saint Anne's presence in the representations of Mary's youth) and apocryphal (textual/visual) developments and insertions into the hagiographic material.

Keywords: Mary, iconography, Apocrypha, miniatures, Presentation to the Temple, France, liturgy.

The New Testament Gospels do not record details on Mary's early life which has been supplemented by Apocryphal literature. The earliest Marian apocryphal reference on it is the second century *Protevangelium of James*² reshaped in the West in sources such as the eight-century *Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew*³ or the tenth-century *Libellus de Nativitate Sanctae Mariae*⁴ which get incorporated into thirteen-to-sixteenth-century hagiographic compilations such as the *Legenda Aurea*, the *Speculum historiale* or the *Speculum humanae salvationis*. The present case study deals with the analysis of a Marian apocryphal episode, the *Presentation to the Temple*, as reflected in visual and textual representations specific for fourteen-to-sixteenth-century France. It discusses the typological connections within which Mary's *Presentation to the Temple* is visually embedded, Marian sacrificial symbolism in an intertextual-apocryphal context, and the cultural-religious frameworks specific for the cults of Saints Mary and Anne in France.⁵

The episode of Mary's *Presentation to the Temple* records that at the age of three, Mary's parents, Saints Anne and Joachim, offer their only daughter to the Temple of the Lord as they have promised prior to her birth. In order to enter the sacred place Mary has to ascend a number of stairs. The iconography of this particular episode, generally, concentrates either (1) on Mary's ascension towards the Temple/altar, hence acting as a willing sacrifice, (1) or on her presence on the altar (2). The iconography of Mary's ascension (Fig. 1) is specific for illuminated French *Speculum historiale* manuscripts.⁶ These visual sources depict the Virgin's entrance either together with her parents or by leaving them behind while walking the stairs. The second group of representations, focus on Mary standing on an altar (Fig. 2 and Fig. 3),⁷ between Saint Anne and a religious figure, having a church interior as background, in illuminated versions of the *Speculum humanae salvationis*. This iconography is constructed mainly on the model of Christ's Presentation at the Temple.⁸ The small sized interiors allow, in both cases, the characters to form a group of which Anne, Mary, and the priest stand out. One should note Anne's gestures as she hands over Mary, with her arms stretched over the altar or by gently pointing towards her. The priest echoes Anne's gestures by accepting a child-like Mary, in representations of the



Fig. 1: Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 50,
Speculum historiale, France, Paris, 1463, fol. 193v

Speculum historiale, and a much more mature Mary in the *Speculum humane salvationis*.⁹ Illuminations of this second source, namely of a mature Mary are typologically paired with depictions of the *Golden Table* showing two bare feet men, in the water, with a fishing net in their hands and an altar or a table in it. The background reveals a shining sun, a church, or the entrance into a church where the very fishermen kneel in front of an altar.

In the *Protevangelium of James*, Mary is brought to the temple in the company of her parents and of a group of virgins having torches in their hands so as she does not change her mind and heart when entering the sacred place. They all go up to the temple where they are welcomed by a priest who sets Mary on the third step of the altar where she dances.¹⁰ The *Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew* changes this episode by concentrating only on the presence of Mary's parents who offer their child as a sacrificial victim to the Temple. Mary is not placed anymore on the third step of the altar, but ascends fifteen steps having completely forgotten about the presence of her parents.¹¹ Mary's dancing in the *Protevangelium* is already eliminated in the *Gospel of the Pseudo-Matthew*, while the three stairs of the altar are supplemented by fifteen stairs.

The *Speculum historiale* offers and explanation for the presence of the fifteen stairs by connecting them to the Psalms. It also develops this episode with topographic details that contribute to the construction of a sacred landscape as it situates the Temple on a mountain. This addition appears in the tenth-century *Libellus de Nativitate Sanctae Mariae* which, then, has



Fig. 2: Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 188, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, France, fifteenth-century, fol. 9v

been incorporated, in the thirteenth century, in the *Legenda Aurea* (as a hill) and, further, in the *Speculum historiale*.¹² Mary gains more independence from her parents as she walks the stairs alone in order to sacrifice herself in the Temple of the Lord. Her autonomy is related to her age as at three years old one leaves behind infancy and masters locomotion.¹³ In the instances where the number of stairs is reduced or lacks completely, the illuminators do not rely that much on the textual sources and, thus: add various details which allow Saint Anne or an angel to hold Mary's hands or guide her way up to the temple or insert details such as dogs, pigeons, folk admiring Mary at the stairs/entrance.¹⁴ This shift is reflected in the discussed miniatures by the reduced space dedicated to the visual narrative allowing the inclusion of (some) architectural details, such as interiors of religious space, or permits the figures to interact by gestures.

The *Speculum humanae salvationis* emphasizes Mary's status as an oblate and offers typological connections for her sacrificial representation.¹⁵ Its main source is the *Legenda Aurea* but it also drew on Lives of saints, Apocrypha, and other non-religious authors, such as Valerius Maximus to which this study comes back later.¹⁶

The folios, that this particular case study deals with, connect Mary's *Presentation to the Temple* with the *Offering of the Golden Table*, the *Sacrifice of Isaac* or *Jephthah's daughter*, and *Queen*

sun/sand as a prefiguration of the Virgin, offered to the true sun, God the creator of the universe. It contrasts the temple of the morning sun with the temple of the eternal sun, God, and the means of Mary's conception, namely of flesh and thought. Furthermore, it indicates her function of giving birth to Christ, the Savior, and the role of Mary's parents in conceiving her. The last reference on Marian genealogy brings also into discussion controversies related to the Immaculate Conception.²¹

The second typological connection, that follows the *Offering of the Golden Table*, is the Old Testament story of Jephthah's daughter (Judg. 11:30-39). Both cases, that of Mary offering herself and Jephthah offering his daughter, bring forth the concepts of vow, sacrifice, and virginity differently. If Saints Anne and Joachim offer Mary as a bloodless sacrifice, Jephthah promises his daughter as a burnt sacrifice. Both cases involve women, generally speaking, regardless of their age. While Mary offers her virginity to God and, thus, will give birth to Christ, Jephthah's daughter grieves over her destiny to die as a virgin as she will not be able to bring forth generations, including that of Christ. This detail of descendancy, hints subtly to Marian representations connected to the Tree of Jesse and the Tree of the World/Cross. Hence, the typological narratives join the apocryphal story by emphasizing and bringing together the concepts of sacrifice, the economy of salvation, holy genealogy, and debates on the Immaculate Conception.

While Mary is placed between her mother, Saint Anne, and the priest, Abyathar, Joachim stands aside as if watching. In most of the cases he is not depicted nimbed, allowing Saint Anne to stand forth. There is a similarity in the gestures of Anne and Jephthah as both of them touch the sacrificial victims positioned on the altars with the slight difference that, in contrast to Jephthah, Sainte Anne offers the sacrifice although none of the textual sources (the *Speculum humanae salvationis* or the *Speculum historiale*) mention that. I argue that the insistence on the presence of Saint Anne in relation to her daughter is a reflection of the rise of her cult specific for the Late Middle Ages, including France. More precisely, the discussed depictions fit into the iconography of Saint Anne that elaborates on the episodes following Mary's birth.²²

Both the *Speculum historiale* and the *Speculum humanae salvationis* suggest sacrificial aspects which offer a different reading to the visual elements specific for the two groups of miniatures, Mary as an altar or Mary as a sacrifice. In this context, the gradual ascension of Mary on the stairs of the Temple (towards the altar) makes her the perfect, self-willing sacrifice offering herself on the altar of God.

The *Speculum historiale* mentions, as *topos* of the narration, a mountain on top of which there is the Temple (and implicitly the altar). The sacrifice of Mary (and Isaac) takes place on a mountain top visually and textually constructed by the details of the stairs and the altar. The mountain becomes a symbolical space of encounter between God and creature, a place where both Mary and Isaac surrender to the will of God. It represents the symbolic center of the universe with paradise on its summit. The visualization of the sacred landscape is underlined by geographical features or architectural complexes linking heaven and earth.²³ In our case, it is either the altar or the representation of the Temple itself that designates this landscape hinting to the indirect presence of God. Emphasis is laid either on the Temple gate (and its elaborated architecture), on the Temple interior (windows, church furniture, religious objects: candle holder) or on the altar covered by a white altar cloth. Hence, symbolically, the illuminations concentrate on depicting the sacred mountain of the Jewish tradition either by representing the altar or an architectural setting, generally a church, situated on the top of a mountain.²⁴ Textually speaking, it is the detail and insistence on Mary's sacrifice that allows for such connections to exist and less the references to the presence of the Temple on the mountain. All these point to less alterations in the apocryphal text and developments in the visual depictions.

Besides the intertextual connections and religious symbolism, the imagery of Mary's *Presenta-*

tion reflects the emergence of the cult of Saint Anne and liturgical developments specific for the discussed period. I continue with indicating some of the specificities of Saint Anne's cultural diffusion in France which is reflected in the visual sources.

Saint Anne is not a biblical figure, the first source in which she appears is the second century *Protevangelium of James*. For creating the figure of Anne, the author drew on the Old Testament, Jewish, and Roman literary sources.²⁵ Anne's cult has been, probably, transferred in the West in the seventh century by refugees from the Muslim conquest.²⁶ Twelfth-century crusader churches in Jerusalem and, later, in Sepphoris, indicate that Anne's cult has been promoted within a view to the pilgrim trade.²⁷ So, it is a crusader, pilgrimage, and transfer of relics context within which Anne's cult is embedded in the West. Her relics are brought from Constantinople or the Holy Land and spread throughout Europe, including France. The Cathedral of Apt, in Provence, claimed to host her veil and her relics brought by, either, the Magdalene and Saint Lazarus, or Auspicius, bishop of Arles.²⁸ Accordingly, the cathedral of Apt offered several relics of Saint Anne to other cathedrals such as Chartres which has also received her head from the count of Blois upon his return from the Fourth Crusade.²⁹ Such cases, point to a favorable reception of the cult of Saint Anne in France, although not as developed as in Northern areas. Furthermore, in the sixteenth century, Saint Anne was venerated in the context of the French royal court,³⁰ while, in the seventeenth-century, the coastal areas of France witness an increase in ex-votos dedicated to her.³¹

The story of Anne's life has circulated in various Western sources. The first one is the tenth century *Historia nativitatis laudabilisque conversationis intactae Dei genetricis* of Hroswitha of Gandersheim, followed by incorporations into Vincent of Beauvais' *Speculum historiale* and Jacobus de Voragine's *Legenda Aurea* in the thirteenth-century. A variant of the story of Saint Anne, *Le Romanz de Sainte Anne et de Nostre Dame et de Nostre Seigneur et de ses Apostres*, is included in thirteenth-fourteenth French folk tradition and offers details to Anne's ancestry and birth.³²

Saint Anne's popularity grew in the High/Late Middle Ages as a variety of sources indicate: sculpture, paintings, and written sources; however, this popularity is present to a lesser degree in France (also Spain and Italy).³³ While in visual representations, Anne functions only as Mary's mother, as a cult figure she has multiple symbolic functions. Anne becomes, as a local shrine saint, associated with a particular piece of territory or devotee or is promoted by a particular family, she is an intercessor in childbearing, a crafts' patron, and an exemplifier of affective behavior in nuns convents.³⁴ Thus, the presence of Saint Anne in the discussed miniatures subtly alludes to her cultural functions which also explains her active presence in the miniatures.

It is another Crusader and (also) diplomatic context within which the spread of Mary's feast of the Presentation originates. Philippe de Mézières, a political figure of the fourteenth century, developed a great devotion to the Virgin Mary while in Cyprus.³⁵ During his time he managed to have the feast and his office of the Presentation approved by Pope Gregory XI and liturgically celebrated in Avignon, in the Church of the Friars Minor, on November 21st, 1372³⁶. He got familiarized with the feast during his stay in Cyprus and he also has introduced it in Venice where it was accompanied by a dramatic representation presumably around 1370.³⁷ De Mézières influenced King Charles V to introduce the feast into France, hence, it was celebrated one year later in the royal chapel on November 21st, 1373. Furthermore, Charles demands the observance of Mary's presentation in all churches and chapels in several letters, such is the letter dedicated to the dean and chapter of Sainte-Marie de Melun, another letter to the masters and students of the College of Navarre at Paris, expresses his confidence in observing the feast. A third letter was sent to Nicholas d'Arcis, bishop of Auxerre, with the aim of extending the feast of the Presentation in the West.³⁸ De Mézières retires to the convent of the Celestines, Paris and further attempts to promote the cult and feast of the Presentation, hence, it was introduced into Metz in 1381.³⁹ This liturgical development, specific for France,

is reflected in the high density of miniatures which coincides chronologically with the emergence of the feast of Mary's Presentation and its universal acceptance. Furthermore, the elaborated religious architecture, the religious figures dressed in church attire as in the iconography of Mary's entry allude to the incorporation of the feast by the Church.

To conclude, I emphasize that the *Presentation to the Temple*, for the miniatures in discussion, has both the textual and visual sources deeply embedded in the symbolism of Marian sacrifice. Although the iconography is, generally, constant subtle hints to the cult of Saint Anne or to liturgical developments are traced while the textual sources incorporate and intertwine apocryphal literature, religious, and historical writings with the purpose of emphasizing human salvation history.

¹ The present case study is a section of the research project: M.A.R.I.A.-Marian Apocryphal Representations in Art: "From Hagiographic Collections to Church Space and Liturgy in Fourteenth-to-Sixteenth-Century France." This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement No. 793043.

² B.D. Ehrman, Z. Pleše, *The Apocryphal Gospels. Texts and Translations*, Oxford 2011.

³ J. Gijssels (ed.), *Libri de Nativitate Mariae. Pseudo-Matthaei Evangelium*, Turnhout 1997.

⁴ R. Beyers (ed.), *Libri de Nativitate Mariae. Libellus de Nativitate Sanctae Mariae*, Turnhout 1997.

⁵ The liturgical dimension concerning the Feast of Mary's *Presentation in the Temple* is not included as it is subject to a different case study. The paper tackles it with brief references only.

⁶ The ascension of Mary towards the altar is found in French versions of the *Speculum historiale*, but also in French versions of *Vies de la Vierge et du Christ* and *Books of Hours*. Due to the length of the present paper, the analysis has eliminated most of the visual sources of these religious manuscripts. The illuminations subject to the present analysis are found in: Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 50, *Speculum historiale*, France, Paris, 1463, fol. 193v; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 316, *Speculum historiale*, Paris, 1333, fol. 291v; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 312, *Speculum historiale*, France, Paris, 1396, fol. 260v; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Nouvelle acquisition française 15940, *Speculum historiale*, France, Paris, 1370-1380, fol. 18v.

⁷ See: Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Latin 512, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, Basel, fifteenth century, fol. 6v; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Arsenal 593, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, Bologna, fourteenth century, fol. 7; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Latin 511, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, France, Alsace, 1370-1380, fol. 5v; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 188, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, France, fifteenth-century, fol. 9v; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 6275, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, Belgium, Bruges, 1485, fol. 6v.

⁸ J. Lafontaine-Dosogne, *Iconographie de l'enfance de la Vierge dans l'Empire Byzantin et en Occident*, Brussels 1964, p. 124. There are certain instances which depict Mary either in the company of her parents, not on the altar, inside the temple or at the entrance of a church indicating that the pattern of Mary's *Presentation* based on the iconography of Christ's *Presentation* begins to change possibly due to the universality of the feast of Mary's entrance. See: Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 316, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, Belgium, Bruges, 1485, fol. 6v; Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Latin 9585, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, fifteenth century, fol. 10.

⁹ The research identified a small number of iconographies of a crowned Mary standing on the altar which is to be developed elsewhere.

¹⁰ «He set her on the third step of the altar, and the Lord God cast his grace down upon her. She danced on her feet, and the entire house of Israel loved her». B.D. Ehrman, Z. Pleše, *The Apocryphal Gospels* cit., p. 44.

¹¹ «When she was placed before the Temple, she ascended the fifteen steps of the Temple so quickly that she did not look back at all or seek after her parents, as infants customarily do. When this happened everyone was struck with wonder, so that the priests of the Temple themselves were amazed. » B.D. Ehrman, Z. Pleše, *ibid.*, p. 67.

¹² See, Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 316, *Speculum historiale*, France, Paris, 1463, fol. 193v. See, J. de Voragine, *The Golden Legend. Readings on the Saints*, vol. I, W.G. Ryan (trans.), Princeton

1995, p. 538. Compare this translation with Kishpaugh's source in which the removal and change of clothes allude to the possibility of a pilgrimage towards the holy mountain. See M.J. Kishpaugh, Sister, *The Feast of the Presentation of the Virgin Mary in the Temple: An Historical and Literary Study*. Unpublished PhD Dissertation, Washington D.C. 1941, p. 8, quoting the *Legenda Aurea*: «And when they were putting off the clothes which they had worn on the journey, and were putting on, as was usual, others that were neater and cleaner, the virgin of the Lord went up all the steps, one after the other, without the hand of anyone leading her or lifting her, in such a manner that, in this respect at least, you would think that she already attained full age».

¹³ With regard to the autonomy of Mary in liturgical drama of de Mézières, see P. L'Hermite-Leclercq, *L'image de la Vierge de la Présentation au Temple dans la pièce de Philippe de Mézières représentée à Avignon en 1372*, in: D. Iogna-Prat, É. Palazzo, D. Russo (eds.), *Marie. Le culte de la Vierge dans la société médiévale*, Paris 1996, p. 366. F. Boespflug, F. Bayle, *Sainte Anne: histoire et représentations*, Paris 2012, p. 56.

¹⁴ F. Boespflug, F. Bayle, *ivi*, pp. 56-57. For instance, in the *Book of Hours* of Duke de Berry, the *Presentation to the Temple* offered contemporary details such as: the architectural similarity of the Cathedral of Bourges represented as the Temple of Jerusalem as a reflection of the Duke's effort of renovating the building.

¹⁵ On typological representations see: J-C. Schmitt, *Les images typologiques au Moyen Âge: À propos du speculum humanae salvationis*, in: M.T. Kretschmer (ed.), *La typologie biblique comme forme de pensée dans l'historiographie médiévale*, Turnhout 2014, pp. 219 - 244. See also: B. Cardon, *Manuscripts of the Speculum Humanae Salvationis in the Southern Netherlands (c. 1410-c. 1470)*, Leuven 1996.

¹⁶ P. Perdrizet, *Étude sur le Speculum Humanae Salvationis*, Paris 1908, pp. 34, 49. See also Kishpaugh, Sister, *The Feast of the Presentation* cit., p. 71. There are thirteenth-century manuscript poems in French on the apocryphal account of the Presentation of the Virgin Mary.

¹⁷ As the text emphasizes the queen's contemplative nature, it has been left out. See, K. Vrudny, *The Significance of Mary's Presentation to the Temple for Medieval Women Surviving Plague*, in: R. Valantasis (ed.), *The Subjective Eye. Essays in Culture, Religion, and Gender in Honour of Margaret R. Miles*, Eugene 2006, pp. 344-350.

¹⁸ Paris, National Library of France, Ms. Français 6276, *Speculum humanae salvationis*, Belgium, Bruges, 1485, fol. 5v.

¹⁹ V. Maximus, *Memorable Doings and Sayings*, vol. I-II, Cambridge, MA: 2000.

²⁰ Perdrizet, *Étude sur le Speculum* cit., pp. 94-95.

²¹ Subject of a different case study within the framework of the same research project funded by the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement No. 793043.

²² F. Boespflug, F. Bayle, *Sainte Anne* cit., p. 39.

²³ M.W. Helms, *Sacred Landscape and the Early Medieval European Cloister. Unity, Paradise, and the Cosmic Mountain*, in: «Anthropos», Bd. 97, H. 2 2002, p. 435.

²⁴ *Ibidem*, pp. 445-446. Other holy mountains, for instance, are the Mount of Calvary (Golgotha) where Christ will return, the Mount of Olives associated with Christ's last days or the Garden of Eden placed on a cosmic mountain.

²⁵ V. Nixon, *Mary's Mother. Sainte Anne in Late Medieval Europe*, Pennsylvania 2004, p. 11. F. Boespflug, F. Bayle, *ivi*, pp. 15-16. K. Ashley, P. Sheingorn, *Introduction*, in: K. Ashley, P. Sheingorn (eds.), *Interpreting Cultural Symbols. Saint Anne in Late Medieval Society*, Athens and London 1990, pp. 6-7.

²⁶ K. Ashley, P. Sheingorn, *ivi*, p. 10.

²⁷ Nixon, *Mary's Mother* cit., p. 13.

²⁸ F. Boespflug, F. Bayle, *Sainte Anne* cit., p. 30.

²⁹ *Ibidem*, p. 31. K. Ashley, P. Sheingorn, *Introduction* cit., p. 18.

³⁰ M.D. Orth, «Madam Sainte Anne» *The Holy Kinship, the Royal Trinity, and Louise of Savoy*, in: K. Ashley, P. Sheingorn (eds.), *Interpreting Cultural Symbols. Saint Anne in Late Medieval Society*, Athens and London 1990, pp. 199-227.

³¹ Nixon, *Mary's Mother* cit., pp. 18, 162.

³² F. Sautman, *Saint Anne in Folk Tradition. Late Medieval France*, in: K. Ashley, P. Sheingorn (eds.), *Interpreting Cultural Symbols. Saint Anne in Late Medieval Society*, Athens and London 1990, pp. 69-94.

³³ Nixon, *Mary's Mother* cit., pp. 1, 162. Nixon does not detail or explain the reasons for which the imagery of Saint Anne is underrepresented in the mentioned regions.

³⁴ Nixon, *ivi*, pp. 17-18. K. Ashley, P. Sheingorn, *Introduction* cit., p. 2.

³⁵ Kishpaugh, Sister, *The Feast of the Presentation* cit., p. 73, note 57. The Presentation of Mary seems to have reached the West already in the twelfth century as indicated by several Hungarian manuscripts as testimony of the influence of Greek culture due to the Hungarian Kingdom's relations with Byzantium and Southern Italy. The feast, however, did not reach other Western areas because it has not been officially commanded by the Latin Church, and the spread of the Greek culture stopped in Hungary due to the Tatar invasion.

³⁶ For the text of the epistle and the dramatic procession see, K. Young, *Phillipe de Mézières' Dramatic Office for the Presentation of the Virgin*, in: «Modern Language Association of America», vol. 26, n. 1., 1911, p. 189. On the role of Philippe de Mézières with regard to the introduction of the Feast of Mary's Presentation, see also Perdrizet, *Étude sur le Speculum* cit., p. 35, note 1.

³⁷ Kishpaugh, Sister, *The Feast of the Presentation* cit., pp. 92-99. See also K. Young, *Phillipe de Mézières' Dramatic Office* cit., pp. 185, 233.

³⁸ Kishpaugh, Sister, *The Feast of the Presentation* cit., 99-102.

³⁹ Liturgical manuscripts indicate that the feast of the Presentation was observed (to a certain degree) prior to Philippe de Mézières as is the case with breviaries. One can mention: the Breviary of Chartres, dated to the thirteenth century, with a fourteenth century insertion of the Presentation; the Breviary of Saint-Amand of Rouen or a thirteenth-century Franciscan Breviary of Franco-Italian origin, used in south-east France, that possibly incorporated the text introduced into France by de Mézières.