

The second part shows in detail the administrative, judicial, economic conditions of the Mudejars, as well as their relationship with Christians. In the third part, the author shows us six paradigmatic studies where the reality of the Mudejar population of this time is shown in a close way.

Finally, we find general conclusions, as well as appendices and a large bibliography and onomastic index.

It is an interesting study on the question of the Mudejars since it not only covers general issues such as politics, economy and society, but also deals with specific cases and aspects of the daily life of the population of the time, a fact that tends to be forgotten in most studies and that is of great interest for the knowledge of this era. Besides, from my point of view, it ends many of the myths that we usually have, such as coexistence or non-coexistence between different religious confessions. Thanks to the numerous documents that he uses from this period, we can observe that, in fact, relations were drawn between Muslims, Christians and Jews, although there were some restrictions. We see, even, that Christians and Muslims allied themselves against an enemy whether Christian or Muslim, so that they could give themselves the opportunity to fight an enemy of the same religious confession. Another myth that the author dismantles is that non-Christians could not have a high social status, we see that many Muslims continued to hold their positions as *qādī* or *alfaqūi*, always maintaining their jurisdiction within the Muslim community, so it means that their laws were respected, although Christianity laws always prevailed.

In my opinion, it is a great study about the different administrative, political and social aspects of the Mudejars in a specific time and place. It has a clear and orderly exhibition, as well as a high quality for the documents used that make us know first-hand the reality, not only of the elites but of the common people and their daily life.

Ana CANO CARILLO

Clohessy Christopher Paul, *Half of my Heart. The Narratives of Zaynab, Daughter of 'Alī* (Islamic History and Thought, 13), Gorgias Press, New Jersey 2018, 287 pp.

Zaynab, the daughter of 'Alī and the granddaughter of the prophet Muḥammad, is an important figure in Islam, and especially to Shī'a Muslims. However, few studies are dedicated to her; among them is this recent study offered by Christopher Clohessy, associate professor at the Pontifical Institute for Arabic and Islamic studies. The volume begins with a Table of Contents (pp. v-vi), Acknowledgments (p. vii), Preface (p. ix), the System of Transliteration followed by the author (p. x), a List of Arabic Shī'i and Sunnī Sources (pp. xi-xvii), and a List of Abbreviations (pp. xix-xx). The main study starts with an introduction (pp. 1-36), followed by four chapters (pp. 37-220). Then the author provides three Addenda: (The Children of Zaynab, pp. 221-230, The Children of al-Ḥusayn, pp. 230-239, and The Consolation of Zaynab, pp. 239-246), followed by an Afterword (pp. 247-268), a Bibliography (pp. 269-276), and an Index of Proper Names (pp. 277-287).

In his long introduction the author provides a clear presentation of the figure in examination, i.e. Zaynab the daughter of Fāṭima (the daughter of the prophet Muḥammad) and 'Alī (the cousin of the Prophet and the fourth Caliph). The main point he argues in this introduction is the importance of the battle of Karbalā' to the Shī'i Muslims, a battle that does not have just a historical value, but also an ethical one since it became an "orientation, a way of walking through life" (p. 3). Since Zaynab had a major role in this battle, and the period after it, the study of her person must be also according to this understanding of the battle of Karbalā'.

To do this study, the author does not limit himself into Shī'i sources, but also examines Sunnī ones. The way Zaynab is presented in these sources is particular and shows different approaches to her personality as a female Islamic figure that should become an example-model and prototype for others. Already arguing

such a point in his Introduction, makes the author criticize classic and modern scholars who dealt with Zaynab and tried to give to her figure, though their examination of her personality, an ideological interpretation for socio-political reasons, such as the gender reading of the sources regarding Zaynab. Therefore, Clohessy declares that his study is an attempt to provide and “explore a ‘Zaynabian’ theology and spirituality”, which means, “allowing the sources to speak for themselves and so to give her [Zaynab] a voice” (pp. 1-14). In this way one might notice the natural transformation of Zaynab’s figure in all its various levels in the different texts in her regards.

In the same introduction Clohessy explains some of his methods in this study. For example on pp. 26-27 he presents the main events in Zaynab’s life in chronological order, declaring that to do this he took into examination all sources and not just the one of al-Ṭabarī which remains the basic source. However in this chronology Clohessy repeats one same event in two different moments without giving any further explanation for this repetition; I refer to the lament of Zaynab upon seeing al-Ḥusayn’s head (p. 27). In his study, Clohessy deals with this event, and discuss this repetition (pp. 148-149, 173-174); therefore one might expect a footnote that leads the reader to this discussion in these pages. In addition, a very important and positive methodological remark one might notice is the detailed chronological presentation of the sources and their division into categories (pp. 27-34), a presentation that helps readers, and especially scholars, to follow the further analysis of these sources, and also to understand how huge and difficult the study offered in this book is.

The last point Clohessy provides in his introduction, which is, according to my reading, important for the reader, is his detailed presentation of the reasons and the aids of writing this volume (pp. 34-36). The first aim is to offer a fresh reading of the life of Zaynab; in this case this study is to be considered the first that presents the life of Zaynab based on the Arabic, Shī‘i and Sunnī sources. The second aim is to study and analyze Zaynab in the period before the battle of Karbalā’, something not been yet done by scholars. The third aim is to provide an analysis of the composite figure of Zaynab, revealing how this figure can be seen “very closer to the daily experience of numerous temporary women” (p. 36). The last aim, as Clohessy himself reveals, is more personal aim; being a Christian scholar who studies a Muslim figure, he aims also to make a comparative study between Zaynab and the Zaynabian theology and spirituality, from one hand, and other biblical figures and their spirituality in Christian tradition, from the other.

The first chapter entitled “In the House of Prophecy” (pp. 37-102) is, in my view, a complete biography one might read regarding Zaynab. The author starts this chapter with an interesting way. He recounts an arcane story about a woman who claimed to be Zaynab during the caliphate of the Abbasid al-Mutawakkil (d. 861 A.D.), that is, two hundred years after her reported death. With such a recount, Clohessy succeeds to attract the attention of his reader from the beginning of the chapter. The reader, then, can read in this chapter what the classic texts transmit about the life of Zaynab: from her birth (c. 627 A.D.), the ‘divine’ choice of her name, the confusion between Zaynab and her younger sister, called also Zaynab and who had also the same *kunya* “Umm Kulthūm”, her marriage to her first cousin ‘Abd Allāh b. Ġa‘far b. Abī Ṭālib b. ‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib, the relation with her mother Fāṭima, her father ‘Alī and her grandfather, the prophet Muḥammad, her role in the caliphate of her father, her support of him and of her brothers after the murder of ‘Alī, her role during the military conflict between ‘Alī and his enemies, her role after the murder of her brothers, and especially during and after the battle of Karbalā’, and finally the discussion regarding the date and the place of her death.

In this first chapter the author collected all the information one might find in classic historians and sources, Shī‘i and Sunnī. He does not simply present this collected information, he also compares between them, discusses the notable differences among them, and gives his critical reading and his opinion regarding such differences and concerning other doubtful information one might find in these sources. In his analysis Clohessy refers also to modern scholars, gives their opinion in regard of problematic events in the life of Zaynab, argues such opinions and gives his own. He is also aware that some of the biographical information belongs to the hagiographical writing genre, while other belongs to the popular traditions. Nevertheless, he confirms that “hagiography is not without value, expressing as it does important elements of popular piety” (p. 101).

I think that this chapter is an important study since it is “unique” in its kind, which offers a whole and complete image on the biography of Zaynab. In addition, one might also learn how to approach classic sources and how to deal with different opinions of modern studies. It is a real original analysis since the author goes to the original sources and does not limit himself in secondary bibliography, something that reveals the level of difficulty the author faced in his research. Such a chapter, as Clohessy declares at its end (p. 102), is the base of the further chapters of this study whose principle purpose is to present a Zaynabian theology and spirituality.

With the second chapter entitled “The Pre-Karbalā’ Narratives” (pp. 103-129), Clohessy aims to demonstrate, through an authentic analysis of the texts that recounts on this period, that Zaynab had a weak character. The chapter begins with a presentation of the main events related to Zaynab in the pre-Karbalā’ period. Even if the author follows the schema of al-Ṭabarī, he adds those events transmitted by other sources arguing at the same time their omission and addition in the various sources. After this presentation he analyses in a detailed way three important events: 1) The Night at al-Ḥuzaymiyya (pp. 105-109); 2) Rumours of War (pp. 109-113); 3) The Dirge (pp. 113-129). First of all, for the three events, Clohessy, not only refers to them and argues the information regarding Zaynab and her character they provide, he also mentions the variant ways each event is transmitted in the different sources; he tries to highlight the role of Zaynab in each transmitted tradition, allowing the text to talk about her, and comparing her with other women of the Islamic tradition, such as her mother Fāṭima and Umm Salama, who was in the same situation of war and losing beloved persons. In addition, Clohessy argues the differentiation between the sources and the reasons of such differentiations.

In all these three events Zaynab is characterized by weakness and grief, a woman who felt that something bad was going to happen to her brother in the battles; a woman who saw visions, heard voices and rumours and tried to understand the reason; a woman who cried when her brother al-Ḥusayn announced to her his coming martyrdom, interpreting those visions and rumours she has seen and heard. I think, in this chapter, Clohessy tries to demonstrate that Zaynab, according to the texts of pre-Karbalā’ period, was a true woman and behaved as all women do when they feel and see the loss of their beloved persons. This chapter, in fact, in my opinion, is written as a critic against those “who have turned Zaynab into a fearless superheroine, tenacious and assured. This may be useful for some political discourse or social narrative, but it is not a true representation of the Zaynab of the texts” (p. 109). Such a study and analysis, then, demonstrates that the author is far away from any idealistic reading, trying to be, as possible, neutral researcher who goes back to the authentic and original sources to see what they truly narrate and provide.

According to my opinion, such a chapter is to be considered the first step of Zaynabian theology and spirituality; the next step is presented in the third chapter entitled “On the Field of Karbalā’” (pp. 131-158). In this third chapter Clohessy describes the reaction of Zaynab during the battle of Karbalā’ when she lost most of the masculine members of her family, the *ahl al-bayt*. Also in this chapter our author compares the sources, discusses the differences related to the reaction of Zaynab every time the news of the killed members were arriving at the tents of women; he also explains the reasons of such differences among the sources. He makes also a comparison between, on the one hand the reaction of Zaynab and the way such reaction is described and, on the other, the reaction and descriptions of other women from the Islamic tradition during a similar situation; through this comparison, then, he succeeds to show the transition in Zaynab’s psychology and behaviour.

For example, for Clohessy, the description of Zaynab as “the first splinter of the moon”, is similar 1) to the way the Prophet is described in some *aḥādīṭ*, during the darkness of the night; and 2) to the people’s faces in the day of Resurrection. In this way he notices an eschatological and mystical dimension of Zaynab’s description which indicates also a development of her character, from a weak to a mystical person, even if such description is accompanied with her lament and weeping (pp. 135-137). Clohessy is right also when he notes that such change in the description of Zaynab’s personality was a kind of preparation to the acme event of Karbalā’, i.e. the martyrdom of her brother al-Ḥusayn. Her words were becoming more measured and restrained, she was not anymore terrified woman, as was in the vigil of Karbalā’, now she, feeling sorrow and expressing lament, was also confuting and challenging the killers

of her family members (pp. 150ff). Again, the method the author applies in his analysis of the texts helps him to note what other scholars could not do: I mean the steps of transformation in Zaynab character, as it transmits by the sources, that demonstrate an evolution in her psychology and present also a development in what Clohessy correctly call Zaynabian spirituality.

In fact, that Zaynab was challenging the killers of her brother, being eyewitness to his martyrdom, shows another step of her psychological preparation, which is, in my view, a decisive development in the Zaynabian spirituality. This time she is ready "to take the leading role in defending the justice of al-Ḥusayn's cause and making Karbalā' the indestructible paradigm of struggle that it has become for every generation of the Shi'a" (p. 158).

This last topic is presented in detail through the fourth chapter, entitled "In the Halls of the Kings" (pp. 159-220). Following the same method into presenting and analysing with comparative way the different narrations related to Zaynab's post-Karbalā' biography, Clohessy highlights the way Zaynab's protesting in front of the governor 'Ubayd Allāh b. Ziyād and the caliph Yazīd b. Mu'āwiya is described. Such a way of analysis makes him affirm that Zaynab in these descriptions, despite all the differences among them, should be considered an archetype of defiant resistance against injustice in its manifold forms. I think the words of Zaynab cited in the pages of this chapter reflect, in fact, the last step of the development of the so-called Zaynabian spirituality. In addition, some of them offer what our author calls Zaynabian theology, that is a list of some "beautiful names" or "theological titles" of al-Ḥusayn, which will become part of the Shi'a popular piety (pp. 169-170).

In p. 193, however, and according to my opinion, the author makes an exaggeration when he compares 'Alī, the survived son of al-Ḥusayn, with Jesus, saying that being 'Alī forced to be present in front of b. Ziyād firstly and then Yazīd b. Mu'āwiya is similar to Jesus who was moving as prisoner between the governor Pontius Pilate and the High Priest.

With this chapter the author concludes his presentation of the biography of Zaynab according to the Arabic Sunnī and Shī'ī sources: Zaynab, after having been in Damascus before the caliph, and after having defended the martyrdom of her brother, with the other survivors of the family of the Prophet, went back to al-Madīna, and continued her life in silence till her death, giving her place as leader to her nephew the Imām 'Alī b. al-Ḥusayn.

If in this study the biography of Zaynab terminates with the fourth chapter, the study by itself continues, since, as I said, Clohessy offers, after the fourth chapter, three Addenda (pp. 221-246). In these Addenda one might find two important discussions: the first is regarding the children of Zaynab; and the second is regarding the children of 'Alī and the question on the fourth Imam. The third Addenda is an English translation of the Consolation Zaynab gave to her nephew after Karbalā'. Also these three Addenda are to be considered an important part of the attempt of Clohessy to rewrite the biography of Zaynab, comparing the different sources and discussing with them, giving also his own opinion, based on his proper reading of the sources themselves.

The comparative aim of this book, between Zaynab and biblical figures is offered in the Afterword where the author make, an unfortunately very brief comparison between Zaynab and the Maccabees mother (pp. 251-252); and between Zaynab and Mary the Magdalene (p. 252). One interesting element that could be a topic of further research, which the author presents also briefly in his Afterword, is Zaynab as an Imāma who lead the Shi'a for few days (pp. 349-350), or as a "prototype and forerunner of those four agents or deputies who would arise to represent the Twelfth and final Imām" (p. 250).

As a scholar of Arab-Christian heritage I find extremely interesting the hymns written for Zaynab, presented at the end of the Afterword (pp. 245-268). Here we need a serious comparative study between those hymns and the ones in the Christian tradition, especially the Arabic translation of the Akathystos for the Virgin Mary. A deep analysis, in addition, of their content, should demonstrate the popular piety for Zaynab, and the theology this piety includes.

In conclusion, I might describe this research as a complete and authentic biography of Zaynab the daughter of 'Alī and Faṭīma, where the figure of Zaynab is presented according the texts and their

narrations. It is a courageous attempt to make and present a Zaynabian theology and spirituality, and attempt, according to my opinion, that needs further research and study. Clohessy, finally, had really succeeded, even in various levels, to realize the aims and purposes of writing this very interesting book.

Bishara EBEID

Clohessy Christopher Paul, *Fāṭima, Daughter of Muḥammad*, 2<sup>d</sup> ed., Gorgias Press, Piscataway 2018, 347 pp. [1<sup>st</sup> ed. 2013]

The origin of this book is a PhD dissertation entitled: *Mother of Sorrows: An Examination of the Life of Fāṭima al-Zahrā', Daughter of Muḥammad, at the Level of Selected Texts of Imāmī Šī'a and Sunnī Islam*, discussed at the PISAI (2006). This book and the successive one (*Half of My Heart, the Narratives of Zaynab, Daughter of 'Alī*, Gorgias Press, Piscataway 2018) represent an important contribution to the English and western library, concerning figures of women in early Islam. Even in Arabic, there is a need for this kind of inclusive studies. The well-known work of 'Ā'īša 'Abd al-Raḥmān, known as Bint al-Šāṭi' (d. 1998), *Tarāḡim sayyidāt bayt al-nubuwwa* (Biographies of the Ladies of the House of Prophethood), Dār al-kitāb al-'arabī, Beirut 1984, which is a collection of previous publications in the 1960s, is already outdated.

The study is well documented, based on a very rich bibliography of Arabic Šī'ī and Sunnī sources from the 1<sup>st</sup>/7<sup>th</sup> century to the 14<sup>th</sup>/20<sup>th</sup> century, as from al-Hilālī (d. c. 80/662) and his *Kitāb Sulaym b. Qays*, one of the oldest Šī'ī texts, until the contemporary 'Allāma Ṭabāṭabā'ī (d. 1983) and his Qur'anic commentary *al-Mīzān*. The A. did a systematic chronological scan of texts concerning Fāṭima in the entire Islamic heritage, mainly Šī'ī *ḥadīṭ* literature but also Qur'anic commentaries, chronicles of history and manuals of spirituality (Ziyārāt literature). This methodology makes possible analyzing the historical development of ideas through the centuries.

The A. considers that "too religious or sacred texts must be studied within the confines of their own genre" (p. 19). He went, in this way, beyond the question of authenticity, to see the *images* of Fatima as reflected in Muslim Heritage, as received or produced by Muslims, both Šī'a and Sunnīs, along history. This methodology reminds me somehow the work of Jaroslav Pelikan; *Jesus Through the Centuries: His Place in the History of Culture*, Yale University Press, 1<sup>st</sup> ed. 1985; and *Mary Through the Centuries: Her Place in the History of Culture*, the same editor, 1<sup>st</sup> ed. 1996.

The book covers the life of Fāṭima from birth, or better pre-existence, to death, passing through her giving birth of al-Ḥusayn, her suffering and sorrow, miracles and honorific names, and finally her eschatological position as intercessor and "the mistress of the women of paradise", with all the hagiographic stories that accompanied these features.

Despite that the study is concerned mainly with the classical and premodern texts, it gives a space for the modern and contemporary debates. The analysis of *Fatima is Fatima* of the Iranian intellectual 'Alī Shari'ati (d. 1977) is extremely important, because it depicts a *modern* and *activist* image of Fāṭima, different from the traditional images established along the centuries. Another contemporary issue is the critical views of the Lebanese Ayatollah Muḥammad Husayn Faḍlallāh (d. 2010), like his denial of the miscarriage of her unborn son (Muḥsin) and some legendary details of her life and heavenly origin, which could be an effort for Šī'ī-Sunnī rapprochement. The A. critically studied the images of Fatima in the Orientalist literature like the positive approach of Louis Massignon (d. 1962) and the polemical approach of Henri Lammens (d. 1937).

The study is not limited to the Twelver Šī'a, it is extended to some doctrinal and liturgical aspects of some heterodox groups like the Nuṣayrī sect, where she is rather divinized. The study is not only descriptive but also comparative, because of double formation of the A., as a catholic priest specialized in Islamic and Šī'ī Studies. That manifests particularly in chapter four, which is divided in two parts: "Part